



## CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

June 23, 2009

### MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, June 23, 2009, 2:00 PM at the City of Tucson Ward 6 Council Office, 3202 E, 1st Street, Tucson, Arizona.

---

#### Primary CCC Members in Attendance

- Phil Swaim, Swaim Associates
- Paul Green, Tucson Audubon Society
- Pat Patton, UA Eller School of Business
- Jane Poynter, Paragon Space Development Corp
- John Schwarz, University of Arizona (retired)
- Joanie Sawyer, PRO Neighborhoods
- James MacAdam, Watershed Management Group
- Tomas Leon, Community Foundation of Southern Arizona
- Ana Maria Lopez, UA College of Medicine (by phone)
- Varga Garland, Community Food Bank

#### Alternate CCC Members in Attendance

- Gregg Garfin, UA Institute for the Study of the Environment
- Curtis Lueck, Curtis Lueck and Associates
- Terry Galligan, Old Pueblo Community Foundation
- Barbara Warren, Physicians for Social Responsibility (retired M.D.)
- Carl Rosborough, Fred G. Acosta Job Corps

#### Staff in Attendance

- Nicole Urban-Lopez, Office of Conservation and Sustainable Development (OCSD)
- Ann Audrey, OCSD
- Bruce Plenk, General Services Department
- Asia Philbin, Tucson Water

#### Public in Attendance

- Jessica Welty, Intern with UA College of Medicine

### AGENDA ITEMS

#### 1. Call to Order / Roll Call

- A quorum was established and the meeting commenced at 2:03 p.m.

#### 2. Welcome and Introductions

- Nicole gave a welcome to this third meeting. She explained that David Schaller is the primary staff support for this committee, but he is currently out of the country and will be back for the July meeting. Introductions were conducted.

#### 3. Approval of Minutes for May 21, 2009

- Pat Patton moved to approve the May 21, 2009 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by John Schwartz. Motion passed unanimously by a voice vote of 12 to 0.

#### **4. General Updates**

- Nicole Urban-Lopez reported that she established a website for this committee which will be used to post and archive of the meeting agendas and minutes and other relevant information for the committee. The website is available at: [www.tucsonaz.gov/ocsd/climatechangecommittee](http://www.tucsonaz.gov/ocsd/climatechangecommittee)
- Nicole reported the release of the City's 3rd Annual Sustainability Report, available at: [www.tucsonaz.gov/ocsd](http://www.tucsonaz.gov/ocsd). Copies of the report were distributed to the Committee.
- Nicole reported that the Office of Conservation and Sustainable Development (OCSD) submitted the City's application for the Energy Efficiency and Conservation Block (EECBG). OCSD will be administering the grant over the next 3 years and additional information about the projects will be posted on the OCSD website.
- Nicole reported that HB 2335 and HB 2536 have passed the State House, and have moved on to the Senate. These bills would allow jurisdictions to create voluntary tax districts to fund solar, water conservation, and gray water systems.
- Bruce Plenk reported that three of seven new solar installations on City facilities have been completed. Three other projects are in the permitting or construction phase. These projects are funded by CREBS.
- Gregg Garfin noted that the Center for Clean Air Policy came out with a report on urban climate adaptation. The report is available at: [http://www.ccap.org/docs/resources/674/Urban\\_Climate\\_Adaptation-FINAL\\_CCAP%206-9-09.pdf](http://www.ccap.org/docs/resources/674/Urban_Climate_Adaptation-FINAL_CCAP%206-9-09.pdf). Staff will post this link on the CCC website.
- Nicole reminded the Committee not to send emails to the entire committee because if an email conversation ensues, it could be in violation of the Open Meeting Law. The CCC was instructed to send Nicole or David any information members want distributed to the entire committee.

#### **5. Selection of Co-chair**

- Phil Swaim offered to serve as Co-chair along with Jane Poynter, who was elected Co-Chair at the May 21, 2009 CCC meeting.
- Phil commented that he has done some Co-chair work on other committees and is willing to assist with the CCC. Phil's work as an architect and with other committees has often involved sustainability.
- John Schwartz moved to nominate Phil Swaim as Co-Chair of the CCC. The motion was seconded by Tomas Leon. The motion passed unanimously by a voice vote of 12 to 0.

#### **6. Selection of Ongoing Committee Meeting Schedule**

- Staff reported that the Doodle poll conducted indicated the 2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday of each month from 2-4 p.m. would work for most people. Those at the meeting indicated this would generally work.
- Joanie Sawyer moved that the 2<sup>nd</sup> Tuesday of each month, from 2 to 4 p.m., be the on-going CCC meeting time. The motion was seconded by Barbara Warren. The motion passed unanimously by a voice vote of 12 to 0.
- Tomas offered use of the conference room at the Community Foundation of Southern Arizona for the CCC meetings. Staff will work with Tomas to schedule the 2009 meetings.
- Another suggestion was finding a site that would be of interest to the group as an example site for sustainability. A regular meeting place could be established and the group could deviate from it if there is a site people want to visit.

#### **7. Discussion and development of a roadmap for the Committee's work**

- Staff distributed a handout with the primary goals of the CCC listed and potential components of a roadmap for achieving these goals. The following discussion followed about the Mitigation Plan elements, the Adaptation Plan elements, the interplay between these plans, and the time frames for each.
  - o Goal 1: Develop a Climate Change Mitigation Plan with measures designed to result in a reduction in greenhouse gases (GHG) equal to 7% below 1990 levels by 2012.
    - It was noted this time frame may not be doable, but the committee should still develop their strategies around this goal.

- Staff explained the 7% goal came from the Kyoto Protocols, which a number of U.S. Mayors signed on to through the Mayors' Climate Protection Agreement (MCPA), including Tucson. John Schwarz thought this 7% level should be discussed before embarking on mitigation discussions.
- It was commented that the committee could recommend that Mayor and Council adopt a different GHG reduction goal, but the Mitigation Plan should include strategies that collectively achieve the 7% reductions.
- Staff clarified that the 7% GHG reduction goal is an aggregate reduction, not a per capita reduction.
- It was suggested that the purpose and importance of the Mitigation Plan be communicated to the public because community education and outreach helps build engagement and public support. Staff pointed out that this is one of the items listed on the draft roadmap distributed.
- It was commented that there is a need to get the message out about what needs to be done to mitigate and adapt to climate change.
- It was pointed out that a 7% GHG reduction equals a 1/3 reduction in green house gases at the same time the population is growing. The Regional Greenhouse Gas Inventory found that 1/3 of the GHG emissions in Tucson come from the transportation sector, so the 7% reduction goal is equivalent to eliminating this sector.
- Goal 2: Develop a Draft Climate Change Adaptation Plan for the City of Tucson.
- Staff asked for the Committee's feedback on whether the Mitigation Plan and the Adaptation Plan should be developed at the same time or if one should be prioritized.
  - One suggestion was to develop both plans simultaneously. Food security needs are Adaptation Plan issues and emergency preparedness is needed for response to severe heat. These issues need to be addressed quickly, so the CCC should work on Adaptation in the near term.
  - Another suggestion was to work on the Mitigation Plan first because we have a GHG reduction goal to achieve by 2012, but still keep an eye on adaptation.
  - It was suggested that a subcommittee could be created to look at Adaptation while the CCC focuses on developing the Mitigation Plan. There was some agreement from the committee about this suggestion.
  - It was commented that water issues will be increasing, which makes both mitigation and adaptation important.
  - It was commented that some mitigation and adaptation efforts overlap, so an integrated approach will be important. There is some synergy between the plans and adaptation should be considered where needed right away when there is overlap between mitigation and adaptation.
  - Clarification about the difference between mitigation and adaptation was requested.
    - It was commented that mitigation is about preventing the occurrence or speed of climate change, often by reducing greenhouse gas emissions.
    - Adaptation is about adapting behavior to deal with climate change including food security, water, and other survival needs.
    - Staff pointed out that mitigation might cost money that is negated by future adaptation needs. For example, it wouldn't be efficient to weatherize a house in a coastal area that will be flooded and inhabitable due to rising sea levels. This is why adaptation must be considered during the development of the Mitigation Plan.
    - It was commented that mitigation efforts can be costly and it is important to save some financial resources for adaptation so we don't run out of funding before the adaptation needs are met.
    - Staff will provide a presentation on the relationship between mitigation and adaptation and the committee can continue the discussion next month.

- A discussion of the Mitigation Roadmap components followed with staff going through the listed items on the handout.
  - Item 1. Target date.
  - Item 2. Educational needs: Staff asked if anything needed to be added or deleted.
    - One option is to save the educational presentations for topic-specific subcommittees. Staff clarified that outside experts can also be appointed to subcommittees.
    - Current pending legislation and funding for related projects was identified as an important educational component for the committee.
    - Another option is to take one meeting to touch on all of the topics listed so the committee gets a general overview of the important topics. There was some agreement from the committee about this approach.
    - Current research and innovation was identified as another important topic.
    - Staff commented that background information on some of these topics can also be posted on the CCC website so members can self-educate.
    - It was also suggested that Committee members attend some of the numerous related workshops in town to learn more about specific topics.
    - Staff was directed to provide a baseline presentation in July on mitigation and adaptation, and any other topics staff thinks are relevant to touch on.
  - Item 3. Subcommittees: Staff commented that the ordinance that created the CCC specifies limits on subcommittees. Subcommittees must have between 3-7 members, including at least one CCC Primary member. Also, no more than 3 subcommittees can be active at time.
  - Item 4. Draft inventory of GHG mitigation measures.
    - Staff reported that there is a summer intern working on compiling these strategies and the goal is to bring them to the CCC by September.
    - It was suggested that GHG reduction strategies be evaluated by each gas.
    - Dr. Overpeck's class may be able to work with the list of GHG reduction strategies to make emission reduction projections and determine expected outcomes.
    - Staff suggested the CCC review and comment on the list of GHG reduction strategies in September and then Dr. Overpeck's students can evaluate it throughout the semester. The results of the evaluation should be available in December or January.
  - Item 5. Select screening criteria for evaluating suggested mitigation measures.
    - It was commented that this will be an important task for the Committee to work on during the fall, October-December. If this is done thoughtfully, then selecting the strategies will be much easier.
  - Item 6. Determine process for selecting final list of strategies.
  - Item 7. Develop public outreach strategy.
  - Item 8. Complete first round of measures screening.
  - Item 9. Continue screening measures.
    - The Committee can work on this from January-March once Dr. Overpeck's students finish evaluating the measures.
  - Item 10. Prepare draft plan for Mayor and Council and public review.
    - Staff suggested preparing a draft Mitigation Plan or list of GHG reduction strategies by April 2010 so that public review could occur at the planned Climate Conversation on Climate Action. A 30 day public comment period should also be included.
    - The Committee agreed to try to have a draft Mitigation Plan completed by April 2010.
  - Item 11. CCC and staff present to Mayor and Council.

- Item 12. Revise draft plan.
- Item 13. Deliver final plan to Mayor and Council.
  - The Committee selected a goal of June 2010.
- Staff reviewed the Adaptation Roadmap going through the listed items on the handout.
  - Staff commented that a few organizations have created adaptation planning models that the committee can utilize. Staff will post the two models (ICLEI and IPCC) on the CCC website.
  - Gregg noted that there are other models from the Center for Clean Air Technologies, San Francisco, and New York that he will give to staff.
  - The Committee decided to table further discussion of the Adaptation Plan Roadmap until after the mitigation/adaptation presentation in July.

## 8. **Asset mapping exercise to identify additional stakeholders that should be aware of the CCC planning process**

- Staff distributed copies of a list of organizations compiled by Sustainable Tucson to act as a starting point for the asset mapping exercise.
- Staff asked the committee to review the list and cross off organizations that are not within the scope of what the committee wants the list to include and to add missing organizations that should be included.
- Discussion was that an all-inclusive comprehensive list might be useful, but substantial staff time would be needed to research all of the organizations in Tucson.
- It was commented that the committee should decide what is the purpose of the list.
- Other note by Dr Lopez: link into public health networks, emergency preparedness networks
- One objective for the list is to inform people about the CCC, its purpose, and its goals as a first level of engagement with a broad list of community organizations.
- Another objective expressed is to identify additional stakeholders and get more strategic about other communications, who to talk more specifically to, etc. to make sure the people involved in grappling with these issues are included, e.g. TEP.
- It was suggested that the Committee draw on everyone's network to figure out who/what the assets are.
- It was commented that the asset mapping could be used to gather data about what is happening in the community, such as how many solar installers there are in Tucson.
- It was suggested that Jan Gordley be asked for her expertise about appropriate communications and public relations.
- Staff summarized the following outcomes from the discussion:
  - One list will be compiled of community organizations/stakeholders for ongoing communication about the CCC's work.
  - A second list will be compiled of resources the committee can draw upon, such as work already being done to tap into and knowledge sharing contacts.
    - It was commented that there are national sources as well because local resources may not meet all of the committees needs. Some national organizations may have local chapters that should be part of network too, such as the USGBC.
  - CCC members can start by emailing their lists of organizations/stakeholders that should know about the CCC, and resources to tap into to Nicole.
  - Staff was directed to check the minutes of the Mayor and Council meeting from when the MCPA was adopted for any stakeholders present that may have commented on the action.

## 9. **Future Agenda Items**

- Motion made by Terry Galligan to approve the following future agenda items. The motion was seconded by Pat Patton.
  - A revised Roadmap outline that includes timelines for completion of the plans
  - Presentation on Mitigation, Adaptation and overview topics members need to be briefed on
  - Suggestions for subcommittee topics and composition, including the option to make motions and vote to create subcommittees.

Motion passed unanimously by a voice vote of 12 to 0.

**10. Call to the Audience**

- Asia Philbin from Tucson Water noted the importance of climate change preparation and energy conservation to the City's water utility and said she would be following the CCC's work.
- Gregg Garfin noted he is providing the City of Phoenix information on climate change issues.
- Barbara Warren provided a CD to members with resources from the Health Effects of Climate Change Conference held in November 2008.

**11. Adjournment** at 4:00 p.m.